

Comparing SARS-CoV-2 natural immunity to vaccine-induced immunity: reinfections versus breakthrough infections

Comments (344)

Previous

Next

Sivan Gazit, Roei Shlezinger, Galit Perez, Roni Lotan, Asaf Peretz, Amir Ben-Tov, Dani Cohen, Khitam Muhsen, Gabriel Chodick, Tal Patalon
doi: <https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.08.24.21262415>

This article is a preprint and has not been peer-reviewed [what does this mean?]. It reports new medical research that has yet to be evaluated and so should not be used to guide clinical practice.

Download PDF

Author Declarations

Data/Code

XML

Email

Share

Citation Tools

COVID-19 SARS-CoV-2 preprints from medRxiv and bioRxiv

Abstract Full Text Info/History Metrics Preview PDF

Abstract

previous infection with SARS-CoV-2 remains unclear.

Methods We conducted a retrospective observational study comparing three groups: (1)SARS-CoV-2-naïve individuals who received a two-dose regimen of the BioNTech/Pfizer mRNA BNT162b2 vaccine, (2)previously infected individuals who have not been vaccinated, and (3)previously infected *and* single dose vaccinated individuals. Three multivariate logistic regression models were applied. In all models we evaluated four outcomes: SARS-CoV-2 infection, symptomatic disease, COVID-19-related hospitalization and death. The follow-up period of June 1 to August 14, 2021, when the Delta variant was dominant in Israel.

Results SARS-CoV-2-naïve vaccinees had a 13.06-fold (95% CI, 8.08 to 21.11) increased risk for breakthrough infection with the Delta variant compared to those previously infected, when the first event (infection or vaccination) occurred during January and February of 2021. The increased risk was significant ($P<0.001$) for symptomatic disease as well. When allowing the infection to occur at any time before vaccination (from March 2020 to February 2021), evidence of waning natural immunity was demonstrated, though SARS-CoV-2 naïve vaccinees had a 5.96-fold (95% CI, 4.85 to 7.33) increased risk for breakthrough infection and a 7.13-fold (95% CI, 5.51 to 9.21) increased risk for symptomatic disease. SARS-CoV-2-naïve vaccinees were also at a greater risk for COVID-19-related-hospitalizations compared to those that were previously infected.

Conclusions This study demonstrated that natural immunity confers longer lasting and stronger protection against infection, symptomatic disease and hospitalization caused by the Delta variant of SARS-CoV-2, compared to the BNT162b2 two-dose vaccine-induced immunity. Individuals who were both previously infected with SARS-CoV-2 and given a single dose of the vaccine gained additional protection against the Delta variant.

Competing Interest Statement

The authors have declared no competing interest.

Funding Statement

There was no external funding for the project.

Author Declarations

I confirm all relevant ethical guidelines have been followed, and any necessary IRB and/or ethics committee approvals have been obtained.

Yes

The details of the IRB/oversight body that provided approval or exemption for the research described are given below:

This study was approved by the MHS (Maccabi Healthcare Services) Institutional Review Board (IRB). Due to the retrospective design of the study, informed consent was waived by the IRB, and all identifying details of the participants were removed before computational analysis.

All necessary patient/participant consent has been obtained and the appropriate institutional forms have been archived.

Yes

I understand that all clinical trials and any other prospective interventional studies must be registered with an ICMJE-approved registry, such as ClinicalTrials.gov. I confirm that any such study reported in the manuscript has been registered and the trial registration ID is provided (note: if posting a prospective study registered retrospectively, please provide a statement in the trial ID field explaining why the study was not registered in advance).

Yes

I have followed all appropriate research reporting guidelines and uploaded the relevant EQUATOR Network research reporting checklist(s) and other pertinent material as supplementary files, if applicable.

Yes

Footnotes

- The authors declare they have no conflict of interest.
- Funding:** There was no external funding for the project.

Paper in collection COVID-19 SARS-CoV-2 preprints from medRxiv and bioRxiv

Copyright The copyright holder for this preprint is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

Preprint discussion sites covering this article:

PubPeer, 30 Aug 2021

Blog posts linking to this article:

- Cafe Hayek, 12 Sep 2021
(Don Boudreaux) TweetHarrison Pitt draws lessons for 2020-2021 from Hayek's 1944 book, The Road to Serfdom. Two slices...
- Power LinePower Line, 11 Sep 2021
(John Hinderaker) Joe Biden's unconstitutional order mandating vaccinations and testing is irrational for several reasons, not...
- Climate Science, 11 Sep 2021
Babylon...
- Iowa Climate, 10 Sep 2021
Babylon...
- Joanne Nova, 10 Sep 2021
Babylon Bee Biden announced that all companies with 100 employees must enforce mandatory vaccination. People will have the...
- Nutri-Link Ltd - Clinical Education, 10 Sep 2021
Reading Time: 10 minutesThe obvious answer is NO, otherwise no one would suffer immune related illness and death. The ability...
- BeScienced, 08 Sep 2021
Charlotte Thälin, Karolinska...
- Naked Science, 07 Sep 2021
Какой иммунитет самый сильный — переболевшего...
- SciPhile, 04 Sep 2021
ביגוד לטענה בפוסט הויראלי של אשרת קוטלר חיסון הוא הדרך הטובה ביותר להימנע מקורונה נעם לוימן ביום רביעי, 1 בספטמבר 2021, התחיל ל...
- Climate Science, 03 Sep 2021
The political and media messaging about the coronavirus prevents the citizenry from connecting the dots and realizing how fear...
- Iowa Climate, 03 Sep 2021
The political and media messaging about the coronavirus prevents the citizenry from connecting the dots and realizing how fear...
- Science Matters Blog, 03 Sep 2021
The political and media messaging about the coronavirus prevents the citizenry from connecting the dots and realizing how fear...
- Front Line Genomics, 03 Sep 2021
Check out our summary of some of the latest news and research surrounding COVID-19 from the past fortnight...
- Paul Craig Roberts, 01 Sep 2021
Israeli Medical Researchers Conclude that natural immunity is far superior to vaccine-induced immunity and has no devastating...
- William M. Briggs, 31 Aug 2021
Once again, I beg you will forgive the use of the words vexxine and vexxinated. They are an attempt to avoid censor bots and...
- Qubit, 31 Aug 2021
Amikor minél több embert kellene meggyőzni arról, hogy oltassa be magát a koronavírus ellen a fertőzés súlyos következményeit...
- Dennik N, 30 Aug 2021
Kalkulácia, že sa človek schválne vystaví koronavírusu, aby získal lepšiu imunitu ako po očkovaní, sa nemusí vyplatiť, lebo človek...
- Statistical Modeling, Causal Inference, and Social Science, 30 Aug 2021
Joe Stover writes: I came across this article that finds vaccinated individuals are 8 to 21x more susceptible to the Delta...
- naked capitalism, 28 Aug 2021
- ZME Science, 27 Aug 2021
This shouldn't be taken as a licence to get infected on purpose.
- SPECIALTIES, 27 Aug 2021
COMPARING SARS-CoV-2 natural immunity to vaccine-induced immunity: reinfections versus breakthrough infections ...
- Jeremy's Blog, 27 Aug 2021
Why make these Covid posts? Isn't the Internet saturated with hot takes already? Am I really adding anything here? I think the...
- Whats New, 26 Aug 2021
Natural immunity against Covid infection could be stronger than vaccination when protecting against Delta variant: Recovered...
- Climate Science, 26 Aug 2021
A shocking new study from Israel compares the protection offered by vaccine-induced immunity versus natural immunity from a...
- Iowa Climate, 26 Aug 2021
A shocking new study from Israel compares the MHS protection offered by vaccine-induced immunity versus natural immunity from a...
- No Trick Zone, 26 Aug 2021
A shocking new study from Israel compares the protection offered by vaccine-induced immunity versus natural immunity from a...
- naked capitalism, 26 Aug 2021

Tweets referencing this article:

Siebe Hoekstra Originals
@siebehoekstra
[@martwoutnl @Roberttvuit @telegraaf Wel zo veilig. https://t.co/S4G6XdExV2](#)
05:59AM

US Shanah Rowe US
@shanrowe75
RT @covid_clarity: STUDY: "This study demonstrated that natural immunity confers longer lasting and stronger protection against infection,...
05:56AM

Joe D
@joeyd1121

Subject Areas

All Articles

- Addiction Medicine
- Allergy and Immunology
- Anesthesia
- Cardiovascular Medicine
- Dentistry and Oral Medicine
- Dermatology
- Emergency Medicine
- Endocrinology (including Diabetes Mellitus and Metabolic Disease)
- Epidemiology
- Forensic Medicine
- Gastroenterology
- Genetic and Genomic Medicine
- Geriatric Medicine
- Health Economics
- Health Informatics
- Health Policy
- Health Systems and Quality Improvement
- Hematology
- HIV/AIDS
- Infectious Diseases (except HIV/AIDS)
- Intensive Care and Critical Care Medicine
- Medical Education
- Medical Ethics
- Nephrology
- Neurology
- Nursing
- Nutrition
- Obstetrics and Gynecology
- Occupational and Environmental Health
- Oncology
- Ophthalmology
- Orthopedics
- Otolaryngology
- Pain Medicine
- Palliative Medicine
- Pathology
- Pediatrics
- Pharmacology and Therapeutics
- Primary Care Research
- Psychiatry and Clinical Psychology
- Public and Global Health
- Radiology and Imaging
- Rehabilitation Medicine and Physical Therapy
- Respiratory Medicine
- Rheumatology
- Sexual and Reproductive Health
- Sports Medicine
- Surgery
- Toxicology
- Transplantation
- Urology

Supported by **Chan Zuckerberg Initiative**